

1 Diana M. Torres (S.B.N. 162284)  
2 diana.torres@kirkland.com  
3 KIRKLAND & ELLIS LLP  
4 333 South Hope Street  
5 Los Angeles, California 90071  
6 Telephone: (213) 680-8400

7 Counsel applying for admission *pro hac vice*:

8 Dale M. Cendali  
9 dale.cendali@kirkland.com

10 Claudia Ray  
11 claudia.ray@kirkland.com

12 Jay P. Lefkowitz  
13 lefkowitz@kirkland.com  
14 KIRKLAND & ELLIS LLP  
15 601 Lexington Avenue  
16 New York, New York 10022  
17 Telephone: (212) 446-4800

18 Attorneys for Defendant Apple Inc.

19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28  
**UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT**  
**NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA**  
**SAN FRANCISCO DIVISION**

17 PONDEROSA TWINS PLUS ONE, RICKY )  
18 SPICER, individually and on behalf of all )  
19 others similarly situated, )

20 Plaintiff,

21 vs.

22 IHEARTMEDIA, INC., SPOTIFY USA INC., )  
23 GOOGLE INC., APPLE INC., PANDORA )  
24 MEDIA, INC., SONY INTERACTIVE )  
25 ENTERTAINMENT, LLC (f/k/a SONY )  
26 COMPUTER ENTERTAINMENT INC.), )  
27 DEEZER, INC. AND SOUNDCLOUD, INC., )

28 Defendants.

CASE NO.: 3:16-cv-05648-MEJ

**STIPULATION AND ~~PROPOSED~~**  
**ORDER RE STAY OF FURTHER**  
**PROCEEDINGS**

1 WHEREAS, Plaintiffs Ponderosa Twins Plus One and Ricky Spicer (collectively,  
2 “Plaintiffs”) initiated the above-captioned matter in the Southern District of California on September  
3 7, 2016;

4 WHEREAS, on October 5, 2016 the above-captioned matter was transferred to the Northern  
5 District of California at Plaintiff’s request<sup>1</sup>;

6 WHEREAS, on October 5, 2016, the Parties entered a stipulation extending the time for  
7 Defendants iHEARTMEDIA, INC., Spotify USA Inc., Google Inc., Apple Inc., Pandora Media, Inc.,  
8 Deezer, Inc. and SoundCloud, Inc. (together with Sony Interactive Entertainment, LLC (f/k/a/ Sony  
9 Computer Entertainment Inc.<sup>2</sup>) (collectively, the “Defendants,” and collectively, the Defendants and  
10 Plaintiffs, the “Parties”) to answer, move, or otherwise respond to Plaintiff’s Complaint to October  
11 28, 2016 (Dkt. No. 19);

12 WHEREAS, Plaintiffs allege various claims against Defendants in their Complaint under  
13 California common and statutory law, including that Defendants violate common law and California  
14 Civil Code § 980(a)(2) by engaging in the unauthorized public performance, reproduction, and  
15 distribution of sound recordings allegedly owned by Plaintiffs that were fixed (i.e., recorded) prior to  
16 February 15, 1972 (“Pre-1972 Sound Recordings”), which Defendants deny; and

17 WHEREAS, numerous parallel cases are pending in other federal district courts involving  
18 substantially similar questions under California and other state laws, *see, e.g., In re iHeartMedia*  
19 *Pre-1972 Sound Recording Litigation*, No. 2:15-cv-04067-PSG-GJSx (C.D. Cal.); *Sheridan v. Sirius*  
20 *XM Radio, Inc.*, No. 3:15-cv-04081-VC (N.D. Cal.); *Ponderosa Twins Plus One v. iHeartMedia,*  
21 *Inc.*, No. 1:16-cv-00953-PAE (S.D.N.Y.); *Sheridan v. Sirius XM Radio, Inc.*, No. 15-cv-07576-  
22 WHW-CLW (D.N.J.); *ABS Entm’t, Inc. v. CBS Corp.*, No. 1:15-cv-06801-JGK (S.D.N.Y.);  
23 *Sheridan v. iHeartMedia, Inc.*, No. 15-cv-07574-WHW-CLW (D.N.J.); *Sheridan v. Sirius XM*

24  
25 <sup>1</sup> In entering this stipulation, Defendants do not consent to personal jurisdiction or agree that venue  
26 is proper in this District.

27 <sup>2</sup> In entering this stipulation, Defendant Sony Interactive Entertainment, LLC (f/k/a/ Sony Computer  
28 Entertainment Inc.) reserves its position that it was neither properly named nor served in this this  
case, but, if it had been properly named and served, would have until and including October 28,  
2016, to respond to Plaintiffs’ complaint.

1 *Radio, Inc.*, No. 1:15-cv-07056-GHW (S.D.N.Y.); *Sheridan v. iHeartMedia, Inc.*, No. 1:15-cv-  
 2 06747-GBD (S.D.N.Y.); *ABS Entm't, Inc. v. iHeartMedia, Inc.*, No. 1:15-cv-06807-ALC  
 3 (S.D.N.Y.); *ABS Entm't, Inc. v. Cumulus Media Inc.*, No. 1:15-cv-06806-PKC (S.D.N.Y.);

4 WHEREAS, a case involving, *inter alia*, the question of whether broadcasting published Pre-  
 5 1972 Sound Recordings requires royalty payments under the California Civil Code § 980 and  
 6 California common law currently is on appeal before the United States Court of Appeals for the  
 7 Ninth Circuit in *Flo & Eddie, Inc. v. Pandora Media, Inc.*, Case, No. 15-55287 (9th Cir., filed Feb.  
 8 24, 2015) (“*Flo & Eddie*”);

9 WHEREAS, other cases pending in federal district courts involving these and substantially  
 10 similar questions under California and other state laws have been stayed pending the resolution of  
 11 *Flo & Eddie* in the Ninth Circuit and/or similar issues concerning New York law, *Flo & Eddie, Inc.*  
 12 *v. Sirius XM Radio, Inc.*, No. 15-1164 (2d Cir.), and Florida law, *Flo & Eddie, Inc. v. Sirius XM*  
 13 *Radio, Inc.*, No. 15-13100 (11th Cir.), *see, e.g., Sheridan v. Sirius XM Radio, Inc. et al.*, No. 3:15-  
 14 cv-04081, Dkt. No. 32 (N.D. Cal. Oct. 28, 2015) (stayed pending outcome of *Flo & Eddie*);  
 15 *Ponderosa Twins Plus One et al. v. iHeartMedia Inc. et al.*, No. 16-cv-00953, Dkt. No. 57 (S.D.N.Y.  
 16 May 3, 2016) (stayed pending outcome of Case No. 15-1164); *Sheridan v. iHeartMedia, Inc.*, No.  
 17 15-cv-07574, Dkt. No. 26 (D.N.J. March 15, 2016) (stayed pending outcome of *Flo & Eddie*, Case  
 18 No. 15-1164, and Case No. No. 15-13100);

19 WHEREAS, the Parties believe that a stay is appropriate because the Ninth Circuit’s decision  
 20 in *Flo & Eddie* regarding whether California Civil Code § 980 requires royalty payments for  
 21 broadcasting published Pre-1972 Sound Recordings is likely to be dispositive of many, if not all, of  
 22 the issues presented in the above-captioned matter, *see Stark v. Wickard*, 321 U.S. 288, 310–11  
 23 (1944) (“If numerous parallel cases are filed, the courts have . . . authority to stay . . . until the  
 24 determination of a test case.”); *Leyva v. Certified Grocers of Cal., Ltd.*, 593 F.2d 857, 863-64 (9th  
 25 Cir. 1979) (district courts “may, with propriety, find it is efficient for its own docket and the fairest  
 26 course for the parties to enter a stay of an action before it, pending resolution of independent  
 27 proceedings which bear upon the case”);  
 28

1 WHEREAS, the Parties have not requested or stipulated to any stays or extensions other than  
2 the stipulation described above extending the time to answer, move or respond to Plaintiff's  
3 Complaint;

4 WHEREAS, a stay would toll all deadlines in the above-captioned matter; and

5 WHEREAS, pursuant to Local Rule 5-1(i), the filer of this document attests that concurrence  
6 in the filing of this document has been obtained from each of the other signatories.

7 NOW THEREFORE, IT IS HEREBY STIPULATED AND AGREED by the Parties, subject  
8 to the Order of the Court:

9 1. All proceedings in the above-captioned matter shall be stayed pending the issuance of  
10 a final order in *Flo & Eddie*.

11 2. Within thirty days of the issuance of a final order in *Flo & Eddie*, the Parties shall file  
12 a joint status report apprising the Court of how the Parties wish to proceed.


13  
14 Dated: October 20, 2016

Respectfully submitted,

15 KIRKLAND & ELLIS LLP

16  
17 /s/ Diana M. Torres  
18 Attorney for Defendant Apple Inc.  
Email: diana.torres@kirkland.com

19  
20  
21 (SIGNATURE BLOCKS ON FOLLOWING PAGES)  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

  
 Jennifer Liakos  
 Hunter J. Shkolnik (Pro Hac Vice Pending)  
 Paul J. Napoli (Pro Hac Vice Pending)  
 Paul B. Maslo (Pro Hac Vice Pending)  
 Salvatore C. Badala (Pro Hac Vice Pending)  
**NAPOLI SHKOLNIK PLLC**  
 525 South Douglas Street, Suite 260  
 El Segundo, CA 90245  
 Telephone: (310) 31-8224  
 Fax: (646) 843-7603  
 Email: jliakos@napolilaw.com  
 Email: hunter@napolilaw.com  
 Email: pnapoli@napolilaw.com  
 Email: pmaslo@napolilaw.com  
 Email: sbadala@napolilaw.com

Brittany Weiner (Pro Hac Vice Pending)  
 Imbesi Law P.C.  
 450 Seventh Avenue, Suite 1408  
 New York, New York 10123  
 (212) 736-0007  
 Email: Brittany@lawicm.com

*Counsel for Plaintiffs*

/s/Michael H. Rubin  
 Michael H. Rubin  
 WILSON SONSINI GOODRICH &  
 ROSATI  
 One Market Plaza  
 Spear Tower, Suite 3300  
 San Francisco, CA 94105-1126  
 Telephone: (415) 947-2000  
 Facsimile: (415) 947-2099  
 Email: mrubin@wsgr.com

*Counsel for Defendants Spotify USA Inc. and  
 Google Inc.*

/s/Ian C. Ballon  
 Ian C. Ballon (SBN 141819)  
 GREENBERG TRAURIG, LLP  
 1840 Century Park East, 19th Floor  
 Los Angeles, CA 90067-2121  
 Tel: 310-586-7700  
 Fax: 310-586-7800  
 Email: Ballon@gtlaw.com

*Attorneys for Defendants Deezer, Inc. and  
 SoundCloud, Inc.*

/s/Joseph Petersen  
 Joseph Petersen (SBN 304597)  
 KILPATRICK TOWNSEND & STOCKTON  
 LLP  
 1080 Marsh Road  
 Menlo Park, CA 94025  
 Telephone: 650-326-2400  
 Facsimile: 650 644 0570  
 Email: jpetersen@kilpatricktownsend.com

*Counsel for Sony Interactive Entertainment  
 Network America LLC (wrongly sued herein as  
 Sony Interactive Entertainment, LLC (f/k/a Sony  
 Computer Entertainment Inc.))*

1 /s/Andrew M. Gass

2 Andrew M. Gass (SBN 259694)  
3 James K. Lynch (SBN 178600)  
4 LATHAM & WATKINS LLP  
5 505 Montgomery Street, Suite 2000  
6 San Francisco, California 94111  
7 Telephone: 415-391-0600  
8 Email: andrew.gass@lw.com  
9 Email: jim.lynch@lw.com

10 *Counsel for Defendants iHeartMedia, Inc.*  
11 *and Pandora Media, Inc.*

12 **PURSUANT TO STIPULATION, IT IS SO ORDERED.**

13 Dated: October 21, 2016

14   
15 \_\_\_\_\_  
16 Honorable Maria-Elena James  
17 United States District Court Magistrate Judge  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

**CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

On October 20, 2016, a true and correct copy of the foregoing were served to all Counsel of record who are deemed to have consented to electronic service via the Court's CM/ECF system per Civ. L.R. 5.4(d).

☒ FEDERAL: I declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the United States of America that the foregoing is true and correct.

Executed on October 20, 2016, in Los Angeles, California.

/s/ Diana M. Torres  
Diana M. Torres